Translation methods of English-Indonesian subtitles in Mariana Atencio’s “TEDx talk: what makes you special?”

Iskandar*, La Sunra, Nurul Aisyah

English Department, Faculty of Languages and Literature, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Makassar, 90221, Indonesia

*e-mail: iskandar@um.ac.id

Abstract

This research aims at finding out methods used to translate connotative and denotative phrases in the video subtitle of Mariana Atencio’s “TEDx Talk: What Makes You Special?”. The video was translated to Indonesian by Badaruddin Saahie and has been reviewed by Santi Deviyanti Rahayu. This research method was qualitative descriptive, focusing on Newmark’s translation theory. The data of this research were taken from the transcript of the video and the provided subtitles. This study revealed twenty-eight phrases with connotative meaning, and the translation process employed both single and mixed methods. Single method types of translation employed were faithful translation, adaptation, free translation, and idiomatic translation, while mixed methods employed faithful and adaptation, faithful and semantic, faithful and communicative, adaptation and communicative, free and idiomatic, and idiomatic and adaptation. This study also revealed twelve phrases with denotative meaning, in which the translator chooses to translate them denotatively using various methods, despite the phrases conveying other meanings. This relates to the second study issue, which explains the connection between denotative meaningful sentences and Newmark (1988) translation approach. Following his observations, the researcher discovered that only one method was used: word-for-word and literal translation. To translate phrases with this denotative meaning, the translator employs two ways simultaneously: word-for-word and literal, literal and adaptation, literal & faithful, faithful & communicative, and Idiomatic & communicative. The researcher may deduce from the previous explanation that mixed techniques and denotative meaning are related in the sense that the combined methods share the same qualities, namely direct, contextual, and communicative. As stated by Fromkin (2001), this is also related to the properties of the denotation itself.

Keywords:
Translation method; single method; mixed method; connotative; denotative; movie subtitles.

1 INTRODUCTION

There are thousands of languages in the world used for communication. Language is our means of interacting, cooperating, and getting along with one another. If two or more people communicate in one language, it is obvious that the communication will occur smoothly. However, the problem may occur from different language backgrounds, creating a communication barrier. A communication barrier is anything that prevents us from receiving and understanding messages that one uses to convey his/her information, ideas, and thoughts (Kumbakonam, 2016). Furthermore, the communication barrier may result in misunderstandings and misinterpretations that lead to conflict. Such a situation demands the existence of a mediator to connect multilingual communication.

One of the effective ways to overcome the language barrier is translation. Abbasi et al. (2012) suggested that translation is remarkably effective in communicating and exchanging knowledge and culture from various languages with different cultures. Translation plays an important role in crossing different cultures and communication. It abridges the communication among all kinds of languages, especially those similar to each other, considering their linguistic features and cultural customs in all parts of the world.

There are many definitions of translation. One is from Catford (1965, p. 20), who argues that “translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (source language) by equivalent textual material in another language (target language). Another definition was proposed by Bell (1991, p.6), stating that it is the “replacement of a representation of a text in one language by a representation of an equivalent text in a second language”. From these two definitions, it is obvious that translation is an activity in which someone transfers a language in text form or source language (SL) to another language text form or target language (TL).

The best translation does not sound like a translation; therefore, we need to pay attention to aspects such as meaning, concept, and cultural values in SL (source language) and TL (target language). According to Newmark (1988), a translator has to comprehend something very clearly, because in translation, nothing is exactly objective or subjective; therefore, there is no absolute translation. There are two types of approaches in translation. There are two approaches to translating, the first paragraph or chapter is read to get the sense of the text, the feeling or tone, and then the translator deliberately sits back, reviews the content, and reads the source-language text. Second, reading the whole text two or three times, finding the intention, register, tone, noting the difficult words and passages, and getting started to translate only when we have taken our bearings. These two approaches give us options whether we trust our intuition or the first method or go with our analytical powers (second method). The first choice is more suitable for literary works, while the second choice is preferably for scientific texts that are more difficult than literary works.

According to Newmark (1988, p.22), the translation process consists of four levels: textual, referential, cohesive, and naturalness. The textual level is the base level dealing with the translation of the source language into the target language. In this level, a translator transposes the source language grammar into the equivalent target language and translates the lexical units into the appropriate context of a sentence. In the referential level, the translators have to summarize in crude lay terms, simplify at the risk of over-simplification, pierce the jargon and penetrate the fog of words. At this level, the translation provides hints of a compromise between text and facts. The cohesive level follows both the structure and the moods of the text, the structure through the connective words (conjunctions, enumerations, reiteration, definite articles,
general words, referential synonyms, punctuation marks) linking the sentence usually proceeding from known information to new information. A translator may reach the level of naturalness by temporarily disengaging from the source language text by reading his translation as though the original text existed. In addition, natural usage comprises a variety of idioms or styles or registers determined by the setting of the text, where it is typically published or found, and by the author, topic and readership.

Newmark’s (1988) theory of translation proposes a single method of translation and the combinations of two or more methods or mixed methods. Each perspective consists of four translation methods. The first perspective provides word-for-word translation, literal translation, faithful translation, and semantic translation, while the second perspective provides adaptation translation, free translation, idiomatic translation, and communicative translation. Those methods are described in a V diagram, as in the following:

![Diagram V of Newmark's theory of translation (1988)](image)

In today’s world, the role of translation is very important in the communication revolution, which is influenced by globalization that led to a varying explosion of demand for translation such as the global capitalist consumer-oriented and growth-fixed economy (House, 2015). The translation is also as cross-linguistic and cross-cultural communication. From this point of view, translation has an important role in opening boundaries between the culture and language of a particular area. We can take the example between English and Indonesian, in which the two languages certainly have different grammars so that to be able to communicate, a translation process is badly needed.

The communication between different cultural members can see a translation that functions as intercultural communication by following different sociocultural rules, including ways of speaking and ranging from national groups such as linguistic minorities. Artar (2017) sees translation as a fifth language skill. These days, we acknowledge four traditional language skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing, but based on his statement in the journal, he said that translation it takes using the basic four language skills. The translation is a tool for knowledge transmission, a protector of cultural heritage, and important regarding human rights and the global issue can be delivered (Bernacka, 2012). When the translator has trouble locating the equivalent of the two languages, the method and structure in SL and TL can be a concern. This means that translation is not easy because the equivalence is hard to decide, as in English to Indonesian or vice versa. Translating is translating the meaning behind the SL word or phrase into TL and considering factors such as situational, linguistic, and cultural contexts to identify its true meaning.

We must remember that the meaning of a word can changes due to time and dialect, and a word translating not only translates the meaning behind the SL word or phrase into TL but also takes into account factors like situational, language, and cultural contexts to identify the true meaning of this word. We should remember that the meaning of a word can also be translated into a symbol; due to changes in time, the influence of dialect and a word that has more than one meaning can also be translated into a symbol. Therefore, the higher the understanding and mastery of the linguistic aspects of a translator, the better the translation work will be.

Prompted by the background elaborated above, this study tried to find connotative and denotative meanings and how translation methods are used to translate the phrases in the subtitle of Mariana Atencio’s “Tedx Talk: What Makes You Special!” The video was translated by Badaruddin Sahe and the reviewed by Santi Deviyanti Rahayu. The video has such an inspiring story about an NBC journalist named Mariana Atencio. During her travels around the world, Mariana learns that these differences make us unique, and the only thing we all have in common is being human. Besides that, during her journey from Haiti to Hong Kong, she met many people with different backgrounds, and she also shared her experiences as an immigrant. It was released on February 3rd, 2017, with a 17:46 minute duration. This video is provided with 14 subtitles, including Indonesian. This study attempted to see explicitly how phrases, either in connotative or denotative form, can be translated into the Indonesian language using translation methods by Newmark (1988).

2 Research Method

This study used a qualitative descriptive method since the research aims to describe and analyze the translation methods used in English-Indonesian subtitles of Mariana Atencio’s “Tedx Talk: What Makes You Special?” Mack (2005) emphasized that the main purpose of qualitative research is to describe variations, individual experiences, explain group relationships and norms. Based on the description above, this study used a qualitative approach because the data generated from the research problem is text or statements. Furthermore, a descriptive study was chosen because, based on the
formulation of the problem, the purpose of this study was to describe the translation method used in the English-Indonesian subtitles in the video. The data were collected through video analysis by transcribing and the talks in the video and the Indonesian subtitle of the video. The transcriptions were then coded by selecting phrases that contain denotative and connotative meanings. These two kinds of phrases were finally analyzed in terms of the methods used to translate the talks.

3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This research focused on finding connotative and denotative phrases in the English and Indonesian subtitles of Mariana Atencio’s “Tedx Talk: What Makes You Special?” and what translation methods were used to translate the phrases in the subtitles.

3.1 Connotative and Denotative Phrases in the Subtitles

The study revealed at least 28 phrases that have connotative meanings. Based on the theory proposed by Fromkin et al. (1990), the connotation is the idea that is suggested or associated with a word that expresses a rhetorical or emotional feeling. Denotation and connotation describe the relationship between the signifier and signified, and an analytical distinction is made between two types of meaning: denotative tagging and connotative tagging (Chandler, 2007). An example of connotative meaning can be found in the extract: “My story begins in Caracas, Venezuela, in South America, where I grew up; a place that to me was, and always will be, filled with magic and wonder.” The Indonesian subtitle states: Cerita saya dimulai dari Caracas, Venezuela, di Amerika Selatan, tempat saya tumbuh besar; satu tempat yang menarik saya adalah, dan akan selalu, penuh daya tarik dan keajaiban.” If we translate it literally to Indonesian, it could be “penuh dengan sihir dan keajaiban.” The word "sihir" doesn't match the context of the speaker's city, which is Caracas, Venezuela. The city that was mentioned has attractions such as beaches and local attractions; therefore, the word “daya tarik” is more suitable. The researcher can conclude that this phrase is connotative based on that understanding.

Another extract says: “I was finally beginning to understand the importance of putting myself in other people's shoes and that is a big part of the reason why I decided to become a journalist. The Indonesian subtitle says: “Akhirnya saya mulai memahami betapa pentingnya memposisikan diri saya di posisi orang lain. Inilah alasan terbesar saya menjadi seorang jurnalis.” Here we can see that the phrase used is "people's shoes" which means "posisi orang lain." Cambridge dictionary suggests that the phrase “people's shoes” is an idiom that means other people's position. The translator understands that this phrase is an idiom and translates it into "other people's position" instead of "sepatur orang lain," which means that the phrase had connotative meaning.

Connotative meaning also applies to the extract: “You see, when we label someone as different, it dehumanizes them in a way. They become “the other.” They are not worthy of our time, not our problem, and in fact, they “the other,” are probably because of our problems. So how do we recognize our blind spots? It begins by understanding what makes you different, by embracing those traits. Only then can you begin to appreciate what makes others special.” The Indonesian subtitle writes: “Saat kita labeli seseorang berbeda, berarti kita tidak memanusiakan mereka. Mereka menjadi “yang lain.” Mereka tidak berharga bagi kita, mereka bukan masalah kita. Sebenarnya, mereka, “yang lain,” justru bisa jadi di adalah penyebab masalah kita. Nah, bagaimana kita mengetahui kekurangan diri sendiri? Mulailah dengan memahami apa yang membuat anda berbeda, dengan cara cara menerima perbedaan tersebut. Dengan begitu Anda kemudian bisa menerima apa yang membuat orang lain spesial.” According to Collins English Dictionary, blind spot means a person seems unable to understand it or see how important it is. It also means an area in your range of vision that you cannot see properly but which you really should be able to see. Blind pot is also an idiom because when we translated literally, ‘blind’ is ‘buta’ and spot is ‘titik,’ so it is ‘titik buta.’ This was categorized as connotative because it used contextual meaning.

Every sentence or phrase can have both types of meaning, it’s just that to understand the meaning used, we have to look at the context and matter of the situation of the sentence or phrase. In this study, the researcher found twelve sentences with denotative meanings. This is because the phrases found from each extracts have the potential for connotative and denotative meanings, only that the translator translated them denotatively. In extract 5, “We are all different. We are all quirky, and unique,” In Indonesian subtitle, it says: “Kita semua berbeda. Masing-masing kita mempunyai keunikan.” The researcher took the phrase “We are all quirky” that was translated into “masing-masing kita mempunyai keunikan,” According to the Oxford dictionary, quirky also means unique or eccentric. The translator used the same word to describe the word, therefore this phrase is a denotative meaning.

Another example of denotative meaning can be found in the extract: “If you’re watching at home, take a piece of paper, and write down what makes you different. You may feel guarded when you look at it, maybe even a little ashamed, maybe even proud.” In Indonesian, the subtitle writes: “Penonton di rumah, silakan ambil semebak kertas, dan tulislah apa yang membuat anda berbeda. Anda mungkin merasa waspada, mungkin sedikit malu, mungkin juga bangga saat membacanya.” According to the Oxford dictionary, to feel guarded means careful or not showing feelings. The translator used the literal meaning on the subtitles; therefore, this phrase was denotative.

3.2 Translation Methods Employed in the Subtitles

In this study, twenty-four extracts were found using six single translation methods and sixteen extracts using mixed translation methods. In translating a written or spoken work, sometimes translators need to combine two or more translation methods to get the perfect equivalent in TL. We presented one or two examples for each method of translation employed.
3.2.1 Single translation methods

3.2.1.1 Word-for-word translation method

The study found two extracts that carried out this translation method. This method is famous for its characteristics of translating cultural words directly. The example of this method is taken from extract 8. In this extract, “Mickey Mouse was not up there (Laughing), and with no cell phone, no Snapchat, or Instagram, I couldn’t look up any information.” The Indonesian subtitle states: “Mickey Mouse tak ada di sana, (tertawa), di sana juga tak ada ponsel, Snapchat, atau Instagram, saya tak bisa mencari informasi apapun.” We can see the phrase “couldn’t look up” translates to “tak bisa mencari.” According to the Oxford dictionary, “couldn’t look up” means finding something or searching. These phrases are translated one by one without producing a double meaning. We can see that this phrase is a form of denotative meaning because it has only one meaning and this translation method is very suitable to be used. According to Newmark (1988), the characteristics of this method are direct and understanding the structure of the source language (SL).

3.2.1.2 Literal translation method

The literal translation method has the characteristics in which the source language (SL) is transferred into the form of the target language (TL) and has little communication value. This method has a denotative meaning, meaning literally. As we can see in extract 1 In the words of Voltaire: “I may not agree with what you have to say, but I will fight to the death to defend your right to say it.” The Indonesian subtitle was written: “Menurut Voltaire: ‘Saya mungkin tak setuju dengan apa yang anda katakan, tapi saya akan berjuang sampai mati membela hak Anda mengatakannya.’” The researcher took the phrase “in the words” because the phrase was shortened, although it can also be translated into this “dalam perkataan.” The translation method used is literal translation because it translates to the nearest TL equivalent and by paying attention to the grammar structure of SL (Newmark, 1988).

3.2.1.3 Faithful translation method

This method is a combination of the two previous methods, namely word-for-word and literal translation methods. This makes the faithful method have a meaning not the same as its source language, also known as connotative meaning (Newmark, 1988). In extract 11, “We are all different. We are all quirky, and unique, and that is what makes us wonderfully human.” The Indonesian subtitle says: “Kita semua berbeda. Masing-masing kita memiliki keunikan dan itu lah yang membuat identitas kita sebagai manusia.” According to Oxford Dictionary, ‘wonderfully’ means a way that inspires delight or admiration, or extremely well. In terms of characteristics, this method was suitable because it emphasized the contextual meaning. Here, the translator wanted to tell us that being different is beautiful; therefore, he translated as “sebagai manusia” because the “wonderfully” context was translated in other parts of the sentence.

3.2.1.4 Adaptation translation method

According to Newmark (1988), the adaption translation method is the freest form translation of all. This method is also used to translate poetry, comedies, narrative text, etc. This makes the meaning of this method connotative which means not the actual meaning but the meaning that adapts to the context of the target language (TL). In extract 15, “See, as a teenager, I wanted to fit in, even more, I wanted to be popular, maybe have a boyfriend for prom and I felt that Fatima just got in the way with her shyness and her strict dress code. I didn’t realize that I was making her feel like the kids at summer camp made me feel.” The Indonesian subtitle writes: “Sebagai remaja, saya ingin diterima dalam lingkungan, saya juga ingin populer, punya pacar yang menemani ke acara prom, karenanya saya ingin Fatima bisa jadi halangan dengan sikap pemuja dan pokaiannya yang tertutup. Tanpa saya sadari justru saya membuat dia merasa yang saya rasa saat masih anak-anak di perkembangan tahun lalu. ” The word ‘strict’ itself means something that you need to follow and obey or in Indonesian it means ‘harus dipahui’ and ‘ketat.’ Dress code in Bahasa means ‘etika berpakaian.’ The result is similar to Newmark’s theory that the phrase was adapted to cultural value of target language (TL).

3.2.1.5 Free translation method

The most recent method that the study found was the free translation method. The main feature of this method is that it translates the content without the original form, for example, “killing two birds with one stone,” this expression also has the same content in Indonesian which “sambil menyelam minum air.” In an extract like “By giving camera time to her and families like hers, I tried to make people see them as human beings, and not simply “illegal aliens” the Indonesian subtitle says: “Dengan menyoroti Angelina dan juga keluarga seperti keluarga Angelina, saya coba membuat orang-orang memandang keluarga ini sebagai manusia, dan sama sekali bukan ‘alien illegal.’” According to Urban Dictionary, cam time also known as camera time means a personalized account of time, in which events are not viewed along with their actual linear temporal order, but rather in the order which the interpreter was made aware of their presence. This phrase has been translated correctly by looking at its connotative meaning in the subtitle. Translated, camera time means ‘waktu kamera,’ which in the context is not suitable. The free translation method translates the matter without the manner, which is exactly what happened in this extract.

3.2.1.6 Idiomatic translation method

Just as the name suggests, this method is usually used to translate an idiom in the source language. This method produces the message of the original but changes the nuance of the meaning, for example, “it’s a piece of cake” which translated “ini sangat mudah.” In extract: “But sometimes, society tells us, and we tell ourselves, we don’t fit the mold,” the Indonesian subtitle says: “Tapi terkadang, lingkungan social maupun diri kita berkata, kita berbeda dengan lingkungan
According to the Thesaurus dictionary, mold has the same meaning with construct or forge which in Indonesian means “cetakan”. The translator took “the mold” as in idioms and referred that into “lingkungan kita” as the forge from the society. Therefore, the suitable method to use is idiomatic translation because it can translate an expression that does not exist in the target language using a meaning approach.

3.2.2 Mixed translation methods

3.2.2.1 Literal and faithful translation methods

In this extract, the translator combined two methods, namely literal and faithful translation. As we can see in the extract: “From a very young age, my parents wanted...” the Indonesian subtitle states: “Sejak kecil, orang tua menginginkan saya ya memiliki pandangan lebih luas tentang dunia.” The first step taken by the translator is to identify the context of the whole sentence. Second, the translator tries to translate word by word and transferred it with a shortened version. This is one of the characteristics of literal method because the source language (SL) is transferred into the form of the target language (TL) and emphasizes the contextual meaning by using faithful literal translation method (Newmark, 1988).

3.2.2.2 Faithful and adaptation translation methods

Here the translator combines faithful method with adaptation in order to understand the meaning of the phrase in extract: “Yes, they broke a law, and they should pay a penalty for it, but they’ve also given everything for this country, like many other immigrants before they have.” The Indonesian subtitle writes: “Benar, mereka melanggar hukum dan mereka harus bertanggung jawab, tapi mereka juga telah memberikan segalanya untuk negeri ini, seperti banyak imigran lain sebelum mereka.” According to Oxford Dictionary, penalty means punishment imposed for breaking the law. The word pay itself is referred to cash or money as the punishment to Angelina’s family for breaking the law. The literal translation for this phrase is ‘Dan mereka harus membayar denda untuk itu’ (refers to illegal immigrant family). The word ‘bertanggung jawab’ is too general, it does not emphasize the punishment. To be able to find a communicative equivalent, the first step taken by the translator is to understand the context of the SL, then look for the meaning of the dictionary and the exact meaning equation in the SL (Newmark, 1988). This step has proven to be effective in translating a term that is not in TL. The combination of these two methods will produce a translation that can be used to translate a poem or narrative text by paying attention to the context contained in the SL without forgetting the cultural values and grammar of the SL and TL.

3.2.2.3 Faithful and Communicative Translation Methods

This is an extract that combines three methods at once, namely Faithful, Free, and communicative. This can be found in extract: “I watched election results with undocumented families.” The Indonesian subtitle says: “Saya menonton hasil pemilihan dengan warga tanpa KTP.” If we look at the similarities between these two methods, they are in the contextual and communicative translation (Newmark, 1988). The speaker said undocumented families which refers to Identity Card (KTP). Even though the speaker did not say anything specific, but the translator caught what Mariana Atencio meant. The steps needed by the translator if he got a phrase like this, namely first translator identify the cultural value, here it means a word that has no real meaning in TL, then look for an equivalent which has the same meaning and must be communicative.

3.2.2.4 Free and Idiomatic Translation Methods

This method is a combination of Free and Idiomatic translation methods that can be used to translate an idiom in the source language. According to Newmark (1988), this method produces the message of the original but changes the nuance of the meaning, for example, “it’s a piece of cake” which translated “ini sangat mudah.” In extract: “I was consumed by my own selfishness and unable to put myself in her shoes,” the Indonesian subtitle writes: “Saya dipengaruhi rasa egois waktu itu. Saya tidak mencoba memposisikan diri saya di posisinya.” According to the Urban dictionary, to put yourself in someone's shoes means to put yourself in other's situation but it doesn’t necessarily mean position. It could mean what they are going through in life, their experiences, or their trouble. Here the translator must identify the content of the idiom in the sentence. Second, emphasize the matter of the SL and find the equivalent of the expressions in TL then translated it.

4 Conclusion

This study found twenty-eight phrases with connotative meaning. A sentence having the connotation can be subjective and not shared equally by all language’s speakers. Connotation is the idea that is suggested with a word that expresses emotional feeling (Fromkin, Rodman, Collin, & Pilar, 1990). From the research conducted, it was found that the single method used was faithful, adaptation, free, and idiomatic. In other phrases, the translator also uses more than one method: Faithful & adaptation, faithful & semantic, faithful & communicative, adaptation & communicative, free & idiomatic, idiomatic & adaptation. From the description above, the researcher concludes that the method tends to pay attention to cultural values, content matter, and is adaptable, which means that it can be adapted to the meaning of the whole sentence and does not forget the communicative value.

This study also revealed twelve phrases with denotative meaning. This is because the phrases are double meaning, but the translator chooses to translate them denotationally using various methods. This is related to the second research question, which explains the relationship between meaningful denotative phrases and the translation method proposed by Newmark (1988). After observing, the researcher found that the single method used was word-for-word and literal translation method. The translator also combines two methods at once to translate phrases with this denotative meaning.
including word-for-word and literal, literal and adaptation, literal and faithful, faithful and communicative, and Idiomatic and communicative. The researcher can conclude from the explanation above related to mixed methods, and denotative meaning, namely the combined methods have the same characteristics, namely direct, using contextual meaning and communicative. This is also related to the characteristics of the denotation itself, as proposed by Fromkin (2001).

REFERENCES